



**ELSI Friday Forum: Structural Racism and Genomics in the Time of COVID
Zoom Chat, November 13, 2020**

12:01:16 From Michael Bentz : Welcome to our inaugural ELSI Friday Forum! We are glad you will spend the hour with us. Use the Q&A function to ask questions. “Like” a question in the Q&A to push the question towards the top of the queue.

TRIGGER WARNING: This presentation includes photos and discussion around topics such as police brutality and identity based discrimination.

12:01:35 From Michael Bentz : Sandra Soo-Jin Lee, PhD Biography:

<https://www.mhe.cuimc.columbia.edu/profile/sandra-s-lee-phd>

12:02:24 From Michael Bentz : Keep up to date with ELSIhub using the below!

Follow us on Twitter @ELSIhub: <https://twitter.com/ELSIhub> and use #ELSIFridayForum for information and updates

Subscribe to our newsletter: <https://elsihub.org/news-and-events/newsletter>

Sign up for our next ELSI Friday Forum: <https://elsihub.org/event/addressing-racism-research-and-clinical-practice>

Join our ELSI scholar directory: <https://elsihub.org/form/submit-scholar>

12:05:25 From Michael Bentz : Kaiser Family Foundation, Racial Disparities in COVID-19: Key Findings from Available Data and Analysis.

<https://www.kff.org/racial-equity-and-health-policy/issue-brief/racial-disparities-covid-19-key-findings-available-data-analysis/> . Published August 17, 2020.

12:05:48 From Michael Bentz : Green ED, Gunter C, Biesecker LG, et al. Strategic vision for improving human health at The Forefront of Genomics.

Nature. 2020;586(7831):683-692. <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41586-020-2817-4>

12:06:27 From Michael Bentz : Dean Dayna Bowen Matthew, JD, PhD
Biography: <https://www.law.gwu.edu/dayna-bowen-matthew>

12:07:46 From Michael Bentz : Vence L. Bonham, JD Biography:
<https://www.genome.gov/staff/Vence-L-Bonham-Jr-JD>

12:10:55 From Ashley Massey
https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp1915987#article_references

12:11:38 From Joseph Graves Jr : Will the contents of the chat box be saved
and distributed to the attendees?

12:12:14 From Michael Bentz : Sellers SL, Cunningham BA, Bonham VL.
Physician Knowledge of Human Genetic Variation, Beliefs About Race and
Genetics, and Use of Race in Clinical Decision-making. J Racial Ethn Health
Disparities. 2019 Feb;6(1):110-116. doi: 10.1007/s40615-018-0505-y. Epub
2018 Jun 20. Erratum in: J Racial Ethn Health Disparities. 2019 Jun;6(3):647-648.
PMID: 29926440; PMCID: PMC6309376.

12:12:23 From Michael Bentz : Link to article:
<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40615-018-0505-y>

12:13:02 From Shu Chen : I would also support that the chat be saved and
distributed to attendees. Thank you

12:13:54 From Michael Bentz : Yes, we will save and make available the
contents of the chat.

12:14:39 From Joseph Graves Jr : My response to Reich's bad genetics can be
found at: 96. Graves JL. In Defense of the "Orthodoxy": Who We Really Are and
Why Some Folks Have a Problem With it. Vernon Farmer (Ed.), Critical Race
Theory in the Academy, New World Publishers, 2020, pp. 107—126.

12:15:33 From Michael Bentz : Green ED, Gunter C, Biesecker LG, Di
Francesco V, Easter CL, Feingold EA, Felsenfeld AL, Kaufman DJ, Ostrander EA,
Pavan WJ, Phillipy AM, Wise AL, Dayal JG, Kish BJ, Mandich A, Wellington CR,
Wetterstrand KA, Bates SA, Leja D, Vasquez S, Gahl WA, Graham BJ, Kastner DL,
Liu P, Rodriguez LL, Solomon BD, Bonham VL, Brody LC, Hutter CM, Manolio TA.
Strategic vision for improving human health at The Forefront of Genomics.
Nature. 2020 Oct;586(7831):683-692. doi: 10.1038/s41586-020-2817-4 =. Epub
2020 Oct 28. PMID: 33116284.

12:15:44 From Michael Bentz : Link to article:
<https://www.nature.com/articles/s41586-020-2817-4>

12:16:05 From Joseph Graves Jr : I also spend some time on this topic in my book with Alan Goodman, Everything You Wanted to Know About Race, But Were Afraid to Ask, Columbia University Press, publication fall 2021.

12:16:49 From Christine Suer to Panelists : How not collecting race data affect response to COVID 19 in France:

https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/europe/coronavirus-france-race-data/2020/06/25/e5b4d0a6-b58d-11ea-9a1d-d3db1cbe07ce_story.html

12:18:17 From Sanda Soo-Jin Lee to Panelists : We welcome your questions. You can use the Q&A.

12:18:38 From Michele Markstein to Panelists : The COVID Racial Data Tracker is a collaboration between the COVID Tracking Project and the Boston University Center for Antiracist Research. Together, we're gathering the most complete and up-to-date race and ethnicity data on COVID-19 in the United States. <https://covidtracking.com/race>

12:19:28 From Michael Bentz : Bonham VL, Green ED, Pérez-Stable EJ. Examining How Race, Ethnicity, and Ancestry Data Are Used in Biomedical Research. JAMA. 2018 Oct 16;320(15):1533-1534. doi: 10.1001/jama.2018.13609. PMID: 30264136; PMCID: PMC6640836.

12:19:36 From Michael Bentz : Link to article:

<https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/article-abstract/2703957>

12:20:18 From Elysia Davis to Panelists : How can we challenge our health care colleagues who staunchly believe that differences in outcomes are due to biological differences instead of social disparities? I have found these conversations to be inflammatory, and it's hard to know how and when to be a firm ally.

12:20:27 From elizabeth cohn to Panelists : Thank you, Vence. Outstanding talk, as ever.

12:20:45 From Michele Markstein : The COVID Racial Data Tracker is a collaboration between the COVID Tracking Project and the Boston University Center for Antiracist Research. Together, they are gathering the most complete and up-to-date race and ethnicity data on COVID-19 in the United States.

<https://covidtracking.com/race>

12:20:49 From Jim Tabery to Panelists : Here-here! Thank you for those powerful words, Vence!

12:21:57 From Joseph Graves Jr : With regards to speaker's last comments: Graves JL and Jarvis D. An Open Letter: Scientists and racial justice,

<https://www.the-scientist.com/editorial/an-open-letter-scientists-and-racial-justice-67648> , June 19, 2020.

Graves JL. Their money, our lives, Science for the People On-line Magazine; <https://magazine.scienceforthepeople.org/web-extras/covid-19-coronavirus-wealth-race-public-health/> , August 2020.

Graves JL. Good genes, bad science, worse policies, Greensboro News and Record, Sunday September 27, 2020. https://greensboro.com/eedition/page-b1/page_ecc409eb-1070-5ef3-b431-6bd969fe0891.html.

12:23:06 From Mildred Cho to Panelists : I think we can make the references and chat available on elsihub.org along with the recorded video

12:29:05 From Joseph Graves Jr : air pollution in the form of PM2.5 has been shown to be contributing to mortality rates from SARS-COV-2; Pozzer et al. 2020, Regional and global contributions of air pollution to risk of death from COVID-19, Cardiovascular Research doi.10.1093/cvr/cvaa288. Of course air quality is racialized in USA.

12:29:10 From Michael Bentz : Link to article:
<https://www.brookings.edu/blog/fixgov/2020/04/09/why-are-blacks-dying-at-higher-rates-from-covid-19/>

12:30:56 From Joseph Graves Jr: Also foreclosures and evictions due to unemployment are going to increase risk of COVID exposure, again racialized in USA.

12:33:41 From Joseph Graves Jr : The biggest problem that authorities don't seem to understand is that while mutations rates of SARS-COV-2 are low, the rising case count insures that the virus will find variants that increase its transmissibility and virulence. I have a flash grant in to study COVID variants in waste water from a predominantly African American community.

12:34:23 From Michael Bentz : TRIGGER WARNING: This presentation includes photos and discussion around topics such as police brutality and identity based discrimination.

12:42:50 From elizabeth cohn to Panelists : Thank you so much! Remarkable.

12:42:53 From Joseph Graves Jr : This fact means that it is logically impossible to identify genetic variants that are differentially responsible for complex disease between racially subordinated and socially dominant people;

see 82. Graves, J.L., Why the non-existence of biological races, does not mean the non-existence of racism, in: "The Mechanisms of Color-Blind Racism," Special Issue of American Behavioral Scientist, DOI: 10.1177/0002764215588810, 2015; 80. Graves, J.L., Great is their sin: Biological Determinism in the Age of Genomics, The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science DOI: 10.1177/0002716215586558, 2015.

12:43:15 From Julie Cakici to Panelists : Wonderful presentations! Thank you both so much!

12:44:49 From Rebecca Jordan-Young to Panelists : ++'relentlessly'

12:45:17 From Joseph Graves Jr : Challenging clinicians on the significance of biological variation and social definitions: 86. Graves J.L., Hurtado, M., Reiber, C., Scotchmoor, J., and Thanukos, A., Evolutionary Science as a method to facilitate higher level thinking and reasoning in medical training, Evolution, Medicine, & Public Health doi: 10.1093/emph/eow029.

12:46:41 From Nicole Lockhart to Panelists : Nature paper just mentioned: <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41562-020-00952-2>

12:46:45 From Nicole Lockhart to Panelists : Here is the Nature article <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41562-020-00952-2>

12:47:16 From Michael Bentz : Link to article mentioned in question: <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41562-020-00952-2>

12:47:21 From Morgan Kinsinger to Panelists : What are some examples of medical practitioners or institutions which are doing anti-racist work you see as effective? What characterizes effective anti-racist work in medicine, based on examples you have witnessed?

12:47:41 From Shawneequa Callier to Panelists : Part of moving forward will require diversity among researchers and also diversity in terms of the questions asked.

12:48:04 From Shawneequa Callier to Panelists : "Despite efforts to promote diversity in the biomedical workforce, there remains a lower rate of funding of National Institutes of Health R01 applications submitted by African-American/black (AA/B) scientists relative to white scientists." <https://advances.sciencemag.org/content/5/10/eaaw7238>

12:48:14 From Joseph Graves Jr : See my discussion of Educational attainment phenotype in Graves 2020; problem here is attempting to make claims about polygenic scores and phenotypes. Educational attainment came into use because polygenic scores on IQ measures were too low to make any

inferences. Due to confounding environmental variables the EA scores are higher, even though many of the individual SNPS have nothing to do with cognitive function.

12:49:35 From Lynn Bush : Thank you all for advancing this conversation and scholarship.

12:50:12 From Shawneequa Callier : Part of moving forward will require diversity among researchers and also diversity in terms of the questions asked.

"Despite efforts to promote diversity in the biomedical workforce, there remains a lower rate of funding of National Institutes of Health R01 applications submitted by African-American/black (AA/B) scientists relative to white scientists." Sorry meant to send this to all:

<https://advances.sciencemag.org/content/5/10/eaaw7238>

12:50:44 From Faith Fletcher to Panelists : For Professor Bonham: What is the role of mentorship and creating an ELSI pipeline of scholars of color in addressing racism

12:51:12 From Faith Fletcher to Panelists : Thank you both for wonderful presentations!

12:53:59 From Joseph Graves Jr : Amen to that!

12:57:05 From Joseph Graves Jr : I have pointed out for some time now that the Eurocentric bias of research paradigms influences research paradigms; Graves, J.L., Evolutionary versus Racial Medicine: Why it Matters? In Race and the Genetic Revolution: Science, Myth and Culture, edited by Sheldon Krimsky and Kathleen Sloan, Columbia University Press, 2011. The approach towards fixing you (because you suffered racism) versus preventing the impacts of racism engender very different research programs.

12:57:32 From Michael Bentz : Following the webinar is an opportunity for the audience to discuss the presentation. Join the webinar using the below invite:

Join Zoom Meeting

<https://columbiacuimc.zoom.us/j/99676422167?pwd=dE1mM2d4MG9uaHR6Vko2YjdRQytQUT09>

Meeting ID: 996 7642 2167

Passcode: 011676

One tap mobile

+16465588656,,99676422167# US (New York)

+13126266799,,99676422167# US (Chicago)

Dial by your location

+1 646 558 8656 US (New York)

+1 312 626 6799 US (Chicago)

+1 301 715 8592 US (Washington D.C)

+1 346 248 7799 US (Houston)

+1 669 900 9128 US (San Jose)

+1 253 215 8782 US (Tacoma)

Meeting ID: 996 7642 2167

12:58:34 From Jim Tabery to Panelists : Thank you to the speakers and organizers! That was wonderful!

12:58:38 From Chris Wensel to Panelists : Thank you! This was an excellent discussion. I appreciate your willingness to present to us.

12:58:39 From Angela Knackstedt to Panelists : Thank you for a wonderful discussion (presentation)!!

12:58:41 From Carolyn Chapman to Panelists : Thank you. Great session.

12:58:46 From Sarah Iden to Panelists : Excellent. Thank you.

12:58:50 From Shawneequa Callier : Wonderful and critically important session!

12:58:56 From Chris Gunter to Panelists : Thank you to both speakers. Fantastic job.

12:59:07 From Elysia Davis to Panelists : Thank you for this conversation!

12:59:12 From Cayla Moore : Thank you Dr. Bonham and Dr. Matthew!!

12:59:16 From Angelica Johnson : Sign up for our next ELSI Friday Forum: <https://elsihub.org/event/addressing-racism-research-and-clinical-practice>

12:59:21 From Steve Joffe to Panelists : Thank you for a superb pair of presentations and discussion.

12:59:21 From Daphne Martschenko to Panelists : Thank you so much! Wonderful, wonderful presentations.

12:59:22 From Beth Tuck to Panelists : Thank you!!!

12:59:30 From Helene Mantineo to Panelists : Thank you so much!

12:59:32 From Laura Milko to Panelists : Thank you for the outstanding presentations, Drs. Matthew and Bonham!

12:59:32 From BETSY STALLWORTH to Panelists : thank you!

12:59:32 From Dr. Shameka Thomas to Panelists : Great job Mr. B!!!

12:59:33 From ASIF CHINWALLA : Thank you so much! Brilliant and impactful reflections — really really helpful.

12:59:33 From Ashley Nicolas to Panelists : Thank you!

12:59:37 From Subhashini Chandrasekharan to Panelists : Thank you for wonderful talks!